







National Forum of Partner Municipalities Swiss Agency on Development and Cooperation Joint UNDP and Coca-Cola /«TM BonAqua» project "Every Drop Matters" United Nations Development Programme

# MINUTES AND CONCLUSIONS OF THE ANNUAL MEETING OF THE NATIONAL FORUM OF PARTNER MUNICIPALITIES OF UNDP PROJECT "MUNICIPAL GOVERNANCE AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME"

10-12 December 2012 Lviv

#### Present:

### Representatives of UNDP/MGSDP:

- 1) Elena Panova, UNDP Deputy Country Director;
- 2) Oksana Remiga, UNDP Senior Programme Manager;
- 3) Iryna Skaliy, UNDP/MGSDP Project Manager;
- 4) Yevgen Zelenko, UNDP Communications Officer;
- 5) Tetyana Kudina, UNDP Programme Associate;
- 6) Leonid Tulovsky, UNDP/MGSDP Quality Management Officer;
- 7) Olena Ursu, UNDP/MGSDP Governance and Sustainable Development Expert;
- 8) Lidiya Movchan, UNDP/MGSDP Finance Assistant;
- g) Galyna Smirnova, UNDP/MGSDP Monitoring and Communication Officer;
- 10) Oleksandra Yudina, UNDP/MGSDP Administrative Assistant;
- 11) Andriy Rudenko, UNDP/MGSDP Driver;

#### National/international experts:

- 1) Ilona Postemska, SDC National Programme Officer;
- 2) Vira Radchenko, Deputy Head of Department of Housing Policy, Ministry of Regional development, Construction, Housing and Municipal Economy (Minregion);
- 3) Sergiy Kosharuk, Deputy Executive Director of Association of Energy Efficiency Cities;
- 4) Velentyna Darnopykh, Executive Director of Association of E-governance municipalities of Ukraine;
- 5) Antonina Domikan, Deputy Executive Director of Association of Small Cities of Ukraine;
- Lidiya Shkurina, Chief Consultant of the Parliamentary Committee on State Construction and Local Self-Governance;
- 7) Ludmyla Dmytruk, Chief Consultant of the Parliamentary Committee on State Construction and Local Self-Governance;
- 8) Olena Savateyeva, Chief Specialist of Department of Housing Policy, Minregion;
- 9) Ludmyla Tytarenko, Chief Specialist of Department of Housing Policy, Minregion;
- 10) Tetyana Mamatova, Consultant of UNDP/MGSDP, professor of NAPA;
- 11) Denys Gurskiy, Consultant of UNDP/MGSDP on innovative social projects;

#### Representatives of partner municipalities:

- 1) Bogdan Bilyk, Department Head on Economic and Integration Development of the Executive Committee of Ivano-Frankivsk City Council, Municipal Project Coordinator in Ivano-Frankivsk municipality;
- 2) Vladimir Boyko, Kagarlyk Deputy Mayor;

- 3) Vladyslav Bonko, Saky Deputy Mayor;
- 4) Petro Vakhnyuk, Municipal Project Coordinator in Rivne municipality, Director of Support to UN Projects Department of Rivne City Council;
- 5) Stepan Veselovskiy, Deputy Director KE "Urban Institute";
- 6) Sergiy Gargat, Executive Director of Centre for Support and Development of Reforms in Dolyna;
- 7) Andriy Grytsenko, Specialist of Municipal Support Unit of Kaharlyk City Council;
- 8) Oleksandr Zayika, Municipal Project Coordinator in Voznesensk municipality;
- 9) Yuliya Gurtova, Specialist of the Department of Support of Municipal Initiatives and Investments of Voznesensk City Council;
- 10) Volodymyr Deboy, Zhytomyr City Mayor;
- 11) Dmytro Zhygulin, director KP REP Bakhchysaray;
- 12) Arkadiy Zaydman, Dzhankoy City Mayor;
- 13) Vasyl Kanyuk, Head of Velikobereznyansky District Council of Zakarpattia Region;
- 14) Oksana Kirilyuk, Ukrainka Deputy Mayor;
- 15) Olexander Kobzarev, director KE "Urban Institute", Lviv;
- 16) Pavlo Kozyrev, City Mayor of Ukraininka;
- 17) Sergiy Kolotov, Novograd-Volynskiy Deputy Mayor;
- 18) Andriy Kuznetsov, head of the urban economy department of Yevpatoria City Council;
- 19) Oleksiy Lesechko specialist first category of Novoozerne Village Council;
- 20) Andriy Lysenko, Chief Specialist of Department of Economic Policy of Rubizhne City Council;
- 21) Dmytro Losev, Deputy Chairman of the National Foundation of Local Self-Governance;
- 22) Vitaliy Lukov, First Deputy Mayor of the executive council of the city of Voznesensk;
- 23) Mariana Malachivska, Lviv City Council;
- 24) Olexandr Melnyk, Municipal Coordinator in Tulchyn;
- 25) Tatiana Nechyporuk, Municipal Project Coordinator in Novoozerne;
- 26) Olga Palagitska, Secretary of Schelkino City Council, AR Crimea;
- 27) Olesya Panchenko, Specialist of Zhytomyr City Council;
- 28) Sergiy Polysyuk, Kirovske Deputy Mayor;
- 29) Oleksander Polishchuk, journalist, Rivne, winner of the journalists' contest;
- 30) Anna Ryebdyeva, participant of the Young Journalists School, Zhytomyr, winner of the journalists' contest;
- 31) Volodymyr Romanenko, Deputy head of IT department, Vinnytsya City Council;
- 32) Eduard Savik, Novovolynsk Deputy Mayor;
- 33) Dmitro Skoropad, head of the Young Journalists School, Zhytomyr, winner of the journalists' contest;
- 34) Volodymyr Smoliy, Department Head on Local Development of Dolyna City Council;
- 35) Roksolana Smoliy, specialist of Dolyna City Council;
- 36) Iryna Sokolovska, head of the kindergarten # 7, Kalynivka City Council;
- 37) Oksana Stefun'ko, Municipal Coordinator in Halych;
- 38) Julia Tabachenko, participant of the Young Journalists School, Zhytomyr, winner of the journalists' contest;
- 39) Olena Tesatska, specialist of Municipal Support Unit of Kalynivka City Council;
- 40) Orestes Trachyk, Galych City Mayor;
- 41) Ilmi Umerov, Head of Bahchysaray Rayon State Administration;
- 42) Oleg Fedoryshyn, Specialist of the Resource Center for Sustainable Development in Ivano-Frankivsk municipality;
- 43) Maryna Furs, journalist of "7 Days", Rivne, winner of the journalists' contest;
- 44) Volodymyr Khomko, Rivne City Mayor;
- 45) Alexander Tsatsuk, Deputy Head of the Housing Department Mykolayiv City Council.
- 46) Anatoly Melnychuk, consultant assistant;
- 47) Orest Mukha, Lviv Centre for investments;
- 48) Volodymyr Dugynets, Lviv Centre for Investments;
- 49) Sofia Burtak, Youth Gender Center named after N. Kobrynska in Lviv;
- 50) Syrtsov Olexandr, a journalist of "Lviv newspaper";
- 51) Eugene Fedyshyn, Publishing house VC "ARS";

#### 1. Opening Session

Opening the meeting, Volodymyr Khomko, Rivne Mayor, Chairman of the National Forum of Partner municipalities (NFPM) welcomed the participants and told about significant results in the area of institutional development achieved by UNDP/MGSDP. Mr. Khomko noted that the work on motivating people in residential houses, educational institutions, Civil Society Organizations to unite and conduct joint actions requires efforts, but leads to a real self-organization. As a result of Rivne partnership with the Programme, the Municipal Sustainable Development Programme of Rivne for 2009-2012 was adopted. Under this programme 30 community projects are supported each year. In 2012, 29 projects are being implemented, out of which 5 projects are co-financed in partnership with UNDP/MGSDP and 24 projects are financed by the City Council in partnership with the communities. The total cost of the projects is UAH 4.9 million. Major achievements of the Programme include empowerment of people through spreading positive examples, sharing experience between communities and municipalities and establishing cooperation between local authorities and communities to address specific issues at the local level. Mr. Khomko highlighted importance of financing the National programme on reform and development of housing and municipal economy for 2009 - 2014 with the amount of UAH 3-4 billion annually.

Elena Panova, UNDP Ukraine Deputy Country Director, welcomed the participants and thanked everyone for participating in the eight Annual Meeting of the National Forum of Partner Municipalities (NFPM). Ms. Panova noted that the presence of representatives of the Association of Small Cities, the Association of e-governance Cities and the Minregion proves the success NFPM platform. Major achievements of the Project in 2012 included improving living conditions of urban residents through the implementation of community projects with wide involvement of communities, development of several municipal e-governance (crowdsourcing project on SWM in Ivano-Frankivsk, projects on introduction of quality management systems in the provision of municipal services, establishment of the Centre for Administrative Services Provision). Ms. Panova particularly noted the approval of standard educational programs for training and retraining of Board members and members of condominiums by the Minregion. Ms. Panova thanked the participants for introduction of the community-based local development approach. UNDP/MGSDP will be completed by the end of 2013, so the next year will be very important in terms of documentation the lessons learned. UNDP will support Ukrainian municipalities after 2013 in the areas of housing and municipal economy through supporting Associations of Co-Owners of Multi Apartment Houses (ACMHs) and energy-efficiency projects, municipal e-governance with social media engagement and innovative approaches to governance. UNDP as a neutral international organization can provide effective interaction between local self-government and Civil Society Organizations. During 2013 the effective ways of further cooperation of UNDP with the municipalities will be identified.

Ilona Postemska, National Programme Officer of the Swiss Cooperation Office in Ukraine, greeted the participants of NFPM. In particular, Ms. Postemska said that SDC will continue further support to villages and small towns for water supply projects, sanitation and waste management, and stressed that the SCO is considering the possibility of providing assistance to municipalities in the area of e-governance.

Oleksandr Alipov, First Deputy Minister of Regional Development, Construction, Housing and Municipal Economy stressed the importance of the work carried out by UNDP. The Ministry supports the partnership with UNDP/MGSDP because it strengthens local self-governance. The Ministry receives positive feedback regarding cooperation with UNDP. Mr. Alipov noted that the achievements of the Project should be widely distributed, Project experience should be applied in legislative process to create self-sufficient communities in Ukraine.

Dmytro Losev, Deputy Chairman of the National Foundation of Local Self-Governance called the priorities in local and regional democracy which are improving governance at the local and regional levels and ensuring that the communities are well informed about the actions of government. The Ministers of the Council of Europe member states in Utrecht Agenda for 2010-2013 identified the main tasks for the Council of Europe member states as increased democratic participation of people in public life at local and regional levels, reduction of the complexity and cost of existing system of local and regional governance and increasing its efficiency, expanding access to housing and municipal services at the local level and greater attention to the growing impact of electronic technologies on citizen participation. Local government reform should be comprehensive to citizens, therefore it is important to introduce e-governance. UNDP/MGSDP successfully manages to cover most of these priorities, said Mr. Losev.

# 2. Presentations of national experts, representatives of communities and partners

Iryna Skaliy, UNDP/MGSDP Project Manager spoke about the achievements of the Project in 2012, among which she marked approval of the model curricula for training for board members and house managers of ACMHs by the Minregion, analytical research on quality management systems (QMS) in the municipal services provision in accordance with standard ISO 9001:2008, creation of the web portal of "Open Government" Partnership" Initiative, creation of social video on effective owner and journalists' competition for the best success story of ACMHs held in partnership with the Minregion. In 2012 piloting the toolkit "Measuring Rule of Law in Public Administration" was completed in Lviv and Feodosiya. Within intermunicipal project on solid waste management implemented in Tulchyn rayon (jointly with the Swiss-Ukrainian project "Decentralization Support in Ukraine") held a public awareness campaign and an Integrated Strategy on solid waste management for the rayon elaborated, pilot houses were equipped with containers for separate waste collection. In 2012, the QMS was introduced in Lviv and and Bakhchysaray, and e-document flow introduced in Dolyna. In Voznesensk e-document flow was introduced and Center for Administrative Services Provision created.

In 2012, 22 community projects were supported, including 4 – in context of a joint project of UNDP and "Coca-Cola" (TM «BonAqua») «Every Drop Matters", worth UAH 2.74 million. In 2013 MGSDP will support the legislative work, in particular in the field of housing and municipal economy, local self-governance and regional development, document the experience, support municipalities in introducing QMS and e-governance, create knowledge management portal "Best practices of e-governance in Ukraine" and support innovative pilot projects involving social media.

Vira Radchenko, Deputy Head of Department of Housing Policy of the Minregion told about 7 priorities for housing reform, which are transparent legislation and deregulation of the industry, a full accounting of resources, monetization of benefits and subsidies, efficient program-based approach "cheap" financial resources, economically justified tariffs, creating effective owner of residential property. Ms. Radchenko told about the progress in implementation and financing of the National programme on reform and development of housing and municipal economy for 2009 - 2014.

Oksana Remiga, UNDP Senior Programme Manager spoke about UNDP priorities in the area of local development and decentralization and presented a vision for future development of MGSDP for 2013-2015. The strategic priorities of UNDP in future will be expanding opportunities to support the creation of ACMHs, supporting innovative practices in municipal governance, developing capacity of civil society to supervise and monitor the quality of services and promoting rational attitude to water resources. Priorities for MGSDP in 2013 will be consolidation of experience and strengthening support of the Government of Ukraine to ensure the sustainability of results, producing analysis and dissemination of the lessons learned, developing new project ideas.

Ilona Postemska, National Programme Officer of the Swiss Cooperation Office in Ukraine told that the Government of Switzerland has worked in Ukraine since mid 1990-s and its aim is to provide technical and financial support. According to the Framework Agreement, signed between the Governments of Ukraine and Switzerland, two Swiss agencies are active in Ukraine: Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation (SDC) (as part of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Switzerland) and the State Secretariat for Economic Affairs (SECO) (as part of the Ministry of Economy of Switzerland). In 2010 a joint strategy of SDC and SECO for the period of 2011-2014 was elaborated. It includes four priority areas: local governance and public services (SDC), reproductive health (SDC), financial and economic sustainability (SECO), sustainable energy management (SECO). Overall budget for 2011-2014 amounts to CHF 60 million (UAH 550 million). Ms. Postemska mentioned that the Government of Switzerland has the following priority directions of its work in the area of local self-governance: energy efficiency in residential buildings, water supply and solid waste management though inter-municipal cooperation.

Leonid Tulovsky, UNDP/MGSDP Quality Management Officer told about new developments in legislation regulating ACMHs and UNDP/MGSDP activities for supporting ACMHs and presented the model educational and professional programmes for acquiring qualification «Manager of the multiapartment house» and for raising qualification of the heads and/or board members of ACMHs. The programmes were reviewed and approved by academia of Kharkiv National Academy of Urban Economy, Kyiv National University of Construction and Architecture, Kyiv University of Management

and Entrepreneurship. The programmes were approved by the Ministry at the section of housing and municipal economy of Scientific and technical council of the Minregion.

Ludmila Dmitruk, Chief Consultant of the Parliamentary Committee on State Building and Local Self-Governance summarized the experience of Committee cooperation with UNDP/MGSDP.

**Tetiana Mamatova**, Consultant presented the key findings of her research conducted under support of UNDP/MGSDP "Introduction of quality management systems in the provision of municipal services in accordance with the requirements of ISO 9001:2008: current practice and areas of improvement."

The second section was devoted to initiatives of partner municipalities in the area of democratic governance, implemented under support of UNDP/MGSDP. At this section the participants presented experience in improving the quality of administrative services provision in Voznesensk, pilot initiative to test the system for separate solid waste collection in five multi-apartment houses (ACMHs) in Tulchyn, supporting sustainable transportation system in Dolyna, sustainability of UNDP/MGSDP Project at the example of Ivano-Frankivsk.

Vira Radchenko, Deputy Head of Department of Housing Policy of the Minregion and Galyna Smirnova, UNDP/MGSDP Monitoring and Communication Officer presented results of the competition for journalists for the best ACMHs success story, which was held in three categories: best analytical material, best reporting material and best video radio piece.

Social video clip on effective ownership of the housing was presented to the participants. The video was produced by UNDP/MGSDP in partnership with the Minregion. The main task of video is to make residents of multi-apartment houses realize that they are co-owners of the house as joint property and should take care of their property.

**Denys Gurskiy** presented ICT tools to mobilize the residents and provided specific examples of innovative social projects. All social projects can be divided into three categories, those on improving specific aspects of quality of life through informing on local problems, raising funds for socially important projects and reorganizing and linking communities.

During the NFPM meeting of UNDP/MGSDP on December 11, a seminar was held to exchange experience between Lviv City Council and other partners municipalities. During the seminar, the representatives of Lviv City Council, its units and communal enterprises presented best practices and innovative solutions in different areas of municipal life.

On December 12, the seminar on the project "Every Drop Matters" was held. **Tetyana Kudina**, UNDP Programme Associate presented achievements of the project. **Oleksandra Yudina**, UNDP/MGSDP Administrative Assistant presented the "Black Sea Box" Project, which aims to rescue the Black Sea through education. Representatives of Dolyna and Ivano-Frankivsk municipalities shared e experience of implementing projects in cities.

# 3. Recommendations of the participants of the Forum

In the process of discussion, the participants of the Forum worked out the following recommendations which are to be taken into consideration by the management of UNDP and donor organisations:

- 1. Representatives of partner municipalities once again drew attention to the need of financing the National programme on reform and development of housing and municipal economy for 2009 2014 in the amount of UAH 3-4 billion annually.
- 2. Develop financial models under UNDP support, which would attract investments, banking and donor financing to the municipalities that apply the community-based local development approach and energy efficient technologies.
- 3. Prepare an appeal from the National Forum of Partner municipalities addressed to the President of Ukraine on non-payment of the local budgets orders by the State Treasury. Thus, the expenditures of local budgets are fully blocked by the State Treasury.

- 4. Continue to support municipalities in implementing projects on e-governance, in particular, introduction of electronic document flow, provision of online services to the citizens.
- 5. Support municipal projects to improve communication of local authorities and communities using Internet, mobile applications and other innovative technologies.
- 6. Conduct educational awareness campaign to make people realize that they are co- owners of multi-apartment houses and should be responsible, and encourage the creation of ACMHs.
- 7. Offer the Government to apply UNDP/MGSDP mechanism for co-financing community projects to address priority problems in urban Ukraine. Representatives of partner municipalities recommended the Government and the MinRegion to provide funds to housing reform first of all to those municipalities which are willing to provide co-financing.
- 8. Apply to the Government to permit municipalities cooperating with international technical assistance projects to carry out financial operations to implement their obligations of co-financing through banks, not the State Treasury.
- 9. In 2013, the Project should focus on sustainability, consolidation and analyzing of project experience in partner municipalities, dissemination of best practices through publications and documentation.
- 10. Within the sub-project "Every Drop Matters" the representatives of municipalities expressed interest in the idea of organizing summer camp, with a goal to educate young people on rational attitude to water resources.
- 11.Devote priority attention to work in the area of developing legislation in order to institutionalize the achievements on the local level. Bring practical experience into legislation and on the level of police development.
- 12. In project selection process give priority to projects aimed at energy saving.
- 13. Provide support for school networks in disseminating knowledge on energy saving, sustainable development through trainings for teachers, providing textbooks, organizing competitions.
- 14. Promote "East West" cooperation for exchange of experience between municipalities.
- 15. Provide training for board members and condominiums represent typical educational and training programs.

## 4. Re-election of the Chairperson of Forum

Pavlo Kozyryev, Ukrayinka City Mayor was selected to be a Chairperson of the National Forum of Partner Municipalities for 2013.

## 5. Closing of the meeting

Pavlo Kozyryev, Ukrayinka City Mayor, a newly appointed Chairperson of the Forum thanked for expressed trust, productive and effective discussion and ensured that Ukrayinka municipality will do its utmost to realize the plans and tasks of the Forum in 2013.

Endorsed by:

The Chairperson of National Forum of Partner Municipalities of UNDP/MGSDP

Pavlo Kozyryev Ukrayinka City Mayor